The goal of a Comprehensive K-3 Reading Policy is to ensure all students read on grade level by the end of 3rd grade. A White Paper by the Center for Public Education explains why 3rd grade “marks a pivot point in reading,” where students go from learning to read to reading to learn. A comprehensive policy ensures early identification of struggling readers and establishes intensive reading intervention for K–3 students who need more support to become successful readers. The policy focuses on demonstrated readiness for promotion, requiring 3rd grade students to demonstrate sufficient reading skills for promotion to 4th grade. Retention can provide struggling readers the additional time and intensive interventions they need to catch up with their peers and be successful in 4th grade and beyond.

**Why is a K-3 Reading Policy Necessary?**

In 2011, the Annie E. Casey Foundation released a report titled, *Double Jeopardy: How Third-Grade Reading Skills and Poverty Influence High School Graduation*. The study analyzed the reading scores and graduation rates of nearly 4,000 students over 10 years. The study found that:

- Children who are not reading proficiently in 3rd grade are four times more likely to drop out of high school.
- Poor black and Hispanic students who are not proficient readers are eight times more likely than proficient readers to drop out of high school.

It’s not only an education problem; it’s an economic and social problem, too. According to the U.S. Department of Education, more than half of U.S. adults aged 16 to 65-years-old (54% or 130 million people) lack proficiency in literacy, reading below the equivalent of a 6th grade level.

The Barbara Bush Foundation for Family Literacy recently released a report on the economic gains of eradicating illiteracy in the United States. The key findings included:

- The average annual income of adults who reach the minimum level for proficiency in literacy (Level 3) is nearly $63,000, significantly higher than the average of almost $48,000 earned by adults who score just below proficiency (Level 2) and much higher than those at low Levels of literacy (Levels 0 and 1), who earn just over $34,000 on average.
- The nation could be losing up to $2.2 trillion annually due to low adult literacy rates.

Literacy is linked to better health, higher levels of civic engagement and higher earnings in the labor market. It is imperative to address the illiteracy problem in our schools early; our students’ futures depend on it.

“The Third-Grade Reading Guarantee is going to be the very heart of education. If you aren’t reading proficiently by the end of 3rd grade, you are going to struggle throughout the rest of your school years.”  ~ Senator Peggy Lehner, Ohio State Senate
WHERE IS THE EVIDENCE?

Since passing a comprehensive early literacy policy:

- Florida is ranked 3rd in the nation in 4th grade reading achievement.
- Mississippi moved from 49th to 21st in the nation in 4th grade reading improvements from 2017-2022.

Source: National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP)

RESEARCH

Key Findings from Guido Schwerdt, Martin West & Marcus Winters, The Effects of Test-based Retention on Student Outcomes Over Time: Regression Discontinuity Evidence from Florida, 2017

- Retention in 3rd grade reduced retention probabilities in future years.
- After six years, the achievement gains from retention remain substantial when compared to peers in the same grade.
- Retention in 3rd grade increased students’ high school GPAs and led them to take fewer remedial courses.

Key Findings from Marcus A. Winters, The Costs and Benefits of Test-Based Promotion, 2018

- The threat of retention led to statistically significant and substantial increases in student math and reading performance within the 3rd grade, prior to the retention decision.
- On average, treatment under the policy led to significant and substantial gains in 8th grade math and reading test scores and increased the probability that students earn a regular diploma.
- The cost of test-based promotion for both taxpayers and treated students is substantially less than suggested in prior research.

Key Findings from Kirsten Slungaard Mumma and Marcus A. Winters, The Effect of Retention Under Mississippi’s Test-Based Promotion Policy, 2023

- For students who were in the 3rd grade in 2014–15, being retained under Mississippi’s policy led to substantially higher ELA scores in the 6th grade.
- By 6th grade, students who were retained had substantial and sustained literacy gains on their ELA scores compared to their peers who were promoted to 4th grade.
- Literacy gains were especially significant among African American and Hispanic students in the cohort.
- Retention under the policy had no significant impact on other outcomes in 6th grade, including math scores, absences, and special education identification.

Key Findings from Holding Back to Move Forward: The Effects of Retention in the Third Grade on Student Outcomes, 2022:

- In Indiana, 3rd grade retention increased achievement in English Language Arts (ELA) and math immediately and substantially, and the positive effects persist into middle school.
Being retained did not have a negative effect on student attendance or disciplinary incidents in later grades. “Student achievement accelerated more rapidly since 2013, after the statewide implementation of the Literacy-Based Promotion Act (LBPA), higher academic standards with aligned assessments and a strong accountability system, and a significant investment in professional development for educators.” Dr. Carey Wright, Former State Superintendent, Mississippi Department of Education

**WHAT IS A COMPREHENSIVE EARLY LITERACY POLICY?**

A successful policy includes early identification, parent involvement, teacher training, intensive reading intervention, retention as a last resort and more intensive intervention in the event of retention. Fundamental principles include:

**Supports for Teachers**

1. **Statewide science of reading training** beginning with K–4 teachers and elementary school administrators
2. Ongoing, job-embedded science of reading training and support for teachers via literacy coaches
3. Ensuring Teacher Prep Programs are preparing teacher candidates to have the knowledge and skills to teach all kids to read based on the science of reading
4. Requiring a minimum/passing score on a teacher licensure test which is grounded in the science of reading
5. **Funding** and reprioritization of existing local, state and federal funds for early literacy

**Assessment and Parent Notification**

6. **Early literacy screening** administered three times per year and progress monitoring for K–3 students
7. Characteristics of dyslexia screening administered at the end of Kindergarten and the beginning of 1st and 2nd grades for all students
8. **Parent notification** when reading deficiency is identified and continued parent engagement with each progress report

**Instruction and Intervention**

9. **District adoption of high-quality instructional materials** grounded in scientifically based reading research and aligned to state standards
10. **Elimination of the three-cueing systems model** of instruction
11. **Individual reading plans** for K–3 students identified with a reading deficiency and 4th grade students promoted for good cause
12. **Regularly monitor student progress** and adjust instruction using proven strategies for closing opportunity gaps according to student need
13. **Evidence-based interventions** for struggling students and supports for special populations (i.e., ELs, special education, students with dyslexia, etc.) during school, and before/after school
14. **Summer Reading Camps or approved innovative summer reading programs** provided to all K–3 students struggling in reading or potentially facing retention
15. **Parent Read-at-Home Plan** for students identified with a reading deficiency and a list of vetted online resource hubs for all parents to support literacy at home
Retention and Intervention

16. **Retention with increased intensive intervention** in addition to a highly effective teacher and other supports for 3rd grade students severely below grade level who do not meet promotion requirements.

17. **Multiple opportunities** to ensure one test on one day is NOT the sole determining factor for promotion to 4th grade (state test, alternative test, portfolio).

18. **Good cause exemptions** for students meeting established criteria.

Learn More

Every state can impact our nation’s literacy crisis. Find out which state statutes and regulations align with ExcelinEd’s Comprehensive Policy and make a plan for future improvement by reviewing the heat map at [Early Literacy Matters](https://www.example.com/early_literacy_matters).